

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF MAINE

IRVING ACQUISITION, INC., et al.,)
)
 Plaintiff,)
)
 v.) 2:13-cv-00271-JAW
) 2:13-cv-00275-JAW
 MARJORY A. KAPLAN, et al.,)
)
 Defendant.)

**ORDER OVERRULING OBJECTION TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE'S
MEMORANDUM DECISION**

On January 31, 2014, Magistrate Judge Rich issued a memorandum decision granting a motion to stay advanced by the Kaplan Parties¹ in this case. *Mem. Dec. on Motion to Stay* (ECF No. 27). The Meriturn Defendants² opposed this motion, and now file a “limited objection” to the Memorandum Decision. *Limited Objection to Magistrate Judge’s Mem. Dec. on Mot. to Stay* (ECF No. 28). They limit their objection to a request to strike one sentence from the Memorandum Decision regarding whether they were in privity with certain entities in the related bankruptcy proceeding. *Id.* at 4. The Meriturn Defendants are concerned that the Magistrate Judge’s comment about privity will become “law of the case,” and prejudice them at later proceedings. *Id.* at 5. They also object to the substance of

¹ The “Kaplan Parties” are Michael W. Kaplan, M. Stephen Kaplan, Marjory A. Kaplan, Glenyce S. Kaplan Lifetime Trust-1994, Prime Tanning Co., Inc. Voting Trust 1994, Estate of Leonard D. Kaplan, Steven A. Goldberg, Glenyce S. Kaplan, Eliseo Pombo, and Robert P. Moore. *Mem. Dec.* at 1.

² The “Meriturn Defendants” are Meriturn Partners, LLC, Mark W. Kehaya, Franklin Staley, and Lee C. Hansen. *Id.* at 2.

the privity conclusion. *Id.* at 5-9. The Kaplan Parties oppose the objection, arguing that the Magistrate Judge’s comment about privity does not give rise to law of the case and is correct on the merits. *Id.* at 1-2.

The Magistrate Judge’s comments regarding privity were:

The Meriturn parties next assert that “there are no issue- or claim-preclusion princip[le]s under which the outcome of the Adversary Proceeding could bear on the disposition of this case[,]” because they “are not parties to, or in privity with the parties to, the Adversary Proceeding[.]” Opposition at 2. This is incorrect. The Meriturn parties are in privity with the Prime entities that are parties to the Adversary Proceeding, Reply at 2 n.1; *see also In re El San Juan Hotel Corp.*, 841 F.2d 6, 10 (1st Cir. 1988) (claim preclusion appropriate if new party has close and significant relationship with original party), but privity would not be the decisive factor in any event. That is because the bankruptcy court’s ruling on the Release Agreement would be binding on the Kaplan parties, potentially mooted their claims in this action. Thus, the case law cited by the Meriturn parties, Opposition at 2, is not on point.

Mem. Dec. at 4.

The Magistrate Judge’s statement about privity is not law of the case for purposes of future proceedings. As the Magistrate Judge wrote, “privity would not be the decisive factor.” *Id.* As it was not necessary to determine whether the Meriturn parties were in privity with the Prime in order to rule on the motion to stay, the Magistrate Judge’s observation about privity was not a decision “upon a rule of law” that binds subsequent proceedings. *Negrón-Almeda v. Santiago*, 579 F.3d 45, 50 (1st Cir. 2009).

With that clarification, it is unnecessary to strike anything from the Memorandum Decision, and the Meriturn Defendants offer no other objection. The Court **OVERRULES** the Meriturn Defendants’ Limited Objection (ECF No. 28).

SO ORDERED.

/s/ John A. Woodcock, Jr.
JOHN A. WOODCOCK, JR.
CHIEF UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Dated this 7th day of March, 2014

Consol Plaintiff

MICHAEL W KAPLAN

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
CURTIS, THAXTER, STEVENS,
BRODER & MICOLEAU
ONE CANAL PLAZA
SUITE 1000
P.O. BOX 7320
PORTLAND, ME 04112-7320
207-774-9000
Email: cchandler@curtisthaxter.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
BURNS & LEVINSON LLP
125 SUMMER STREET
BOSTON, MA 02110
(617) 345-3000
Email: lgreen@burnslev.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Plaintiff

M STEPHEN KAPLAN

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Plaintiff

MARJORY A KAPLAN

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Plaintiff

**GLENYCE S KAPLAN
LIFETIME TRUST-1994**

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Plaintiff

**PRIME TANNING CO INC
VOTING TRUST 1994**

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Plaintiff

**ESTATE OF LEONARD D
KAPLAN**

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Plaintiff

STEVEN A GOLDBERG

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Plaintiff

GLENYCE S KAPLAN

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Plaintiff

ELISEO POMBO

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Plaintiff

ROBERT B MOORE

represented by **CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAWRENCE G. GREEN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

IRVING ACQUISITION INC

represented by **MELISSA A. HEWEY**
DRUMMOND WOODSUM
84 MARGINAL WAY
SUITE 600
PORTLAND, ME 04101-2480
207-772-1941
Email: mhewey@dwmlaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JEFFREY TAYLOR PIAMPANO
DRUMMOND WOODSUM
84 MARGINAL WAY
SUITE 600

PORTLAND, ME 04101-2480
207-772-1941
Email: jpiampiano@dwmlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

MERITURN PARTNERS LLC

represented by **MELISSA A. HEWEY**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JEFFREY TAYLOR PIAMPIANO
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

MICHAEL W KAPLAN

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

M STEPHEN KAPLAN

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

MARJORY A KAPLAN

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**GLENYCE S KAPLAN
LIFETIME TRUST-1994**

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

LEONARD D KAPLAN ESTATE

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

GLENYCE S KAPLAN

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**PRIME TANNING CO INC
VOTING TRUST - 1994**

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Consol Defendant

MERITURN PARTNERS LLC

represented by **JEFFREY TAYLOR PIAMPANO**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Defendant

MARK W KEHAYA

represented by **JEFFREY TAYLOR PIAMPANO**
(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Defendant

FRANKLIN STALEY

represented by **JEFFREY TAYLOR PIAMPANO**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Consol Defendant

LEE C HANSEN

represented by **JEFFREY TAYLOR PIAMPANO**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

**GLENYCE S KAPLAN
LIFETIME TRUST-1994**

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

MICHAEL W KAPLAN

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

**PRIME TANNING CO INC
VOTING TRUST - 1994**

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

GLENYCE S KAPLAN

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

LEONARD D KAPLAN ESTATE

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

M STEPHEN KAPLAN

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

MARJORY A KAPLAN

represented by **LAWRENCE G. GREEN**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTIAN T. CHANDLER
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Counter Defendant

MERITURN PARTNERS LLC

represented by **MELISSA A. HEWEY**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED