

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF MAINE**

CONSUMER ADVISORY BOARD, et al.,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	
)	
v.)	Docket no. 91-CV-321-P-S
)	
BRENDA HARVEY, et al.,)	
)	
)	
Defendants.)	

ORDER ON MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION

Before the Court is a motion titled, “Motion for Further Findings and Conclusions and/or to Clarify, Alter or Amend the Judgment” (Docket # 399), which the Court treats as a motion for reconsideration of its Order on Motion for Relief from Judgment (Docket # 398). The Motion (Docket # 399) is hereby DENIED.

The Court need only offer a brief response to Plaintiffs’ newfound yet meritless arguments. First, no trial was held in this matter because the Consent Decree was entered as the culmination of the parties’ approved settlement. (See Docket #s 62-66.) As a result, the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 52(a)(1) are inapplicable to the Court’s proceedings on Defendants’ Motion for Relief from Judgment. Nonetheless, the Court notes that the Order on Motion for Relief from Judgment (Docket # 398) clearly incorporated all of its prior orders adopting the findings and conclusions of the Special Master. (See March 19, 2010 Order at 4 n. 2.) The Court also entered the separate Order Accepting the Final Report of the Special Master (Docket # 387), which included findings regarding the mechanisms for future compliance.¹ In so doing, the Court believes that it complied with Rule 52(a)(4). No further findings are necessary as the multitude of adopted findings provides a substantial factual foundation for the Court’s decision to terminate the Decree.

¹ Specifically, the Court found that the Person Centered Planning (PCP) process, the Grievance and Appeal process, Advocacy Services, Adult Protective Services (APS) and Quality Assurance all included systems that can serve as mechanisms for future compliance. (See Feb. 2, 2010 Order (Docket # 387) at 2.) Thus, the adopted findings as to these five certification areas serve as the factual foundation for the Court’s legal conclusion that there are mechanisms in place to assure future compliance.

Second, Plaintiffs' belated request² for a declaration that each class member has perpetual rights to various annual exams, eyeglasses (as needed), respite care, etc. is bewildering. As a result of the Decree's termination, this Court is no longer supervising Defendants' provision of these services to class members. To the extent that any member of the class believes that they are being wrongly denied an annual medical examination, an annual dental examination, eyeglasses, respite care or attorney's fees on any grievance, a claim may be presented in the appropriate state forum. See, e.g., 34-B M.R.S.A. §§ 5005(3), 5604-A, 5606. The Court states no opinion on the validity of any such claim. In fact, it would be wholly inappropriate for this Court to offer further "guidance to the parties about their future rights and obligations." (Pls.' Reply (Docket # 401) at 2.)

Finally, Plaintiffs' Motion makes repeated reference to the "Next Court Order," which is nothing more than a draft document circulated amongst the parties and the Special Master when all sides were still collaborating towards a joint motion for termination of the Decree. The mere fact that such an order might have been entered with the agreement of both sides does not mean that such an order was required. Rather, in light of Defendants' apparent objection to the "Next Court Order," the Court believes that such an order is not warranted. In short, the "gap" that Plaintiffs seek to fill with a next court order or amended judgment is simply a gap between the Court's plain reading of the 1994 Consent Decree and Plaintiff's wishful reading, which contemplates perpetual federal oversight and detailed lifetime commitments to each class member. Neither the factual record, the language of the Decree, nor the holding of Horne v. Flores, -- U.S. ---, 129 S. Ct. 2579 (2009) provide a basis for the Court to provide the oversight or declarations Plaintiffs now seek. For this reason, the Court DENIES Plaintiffs' Motion (Docket # 399).

SO ORDERED.

/s/ George Z. Singal
United States District Judge

Dated this 20th day of April, 2010.

² The Court describes the request as belated because in opposing the Motion for Relief from Judgment, Plaintiffs did not specifically argue that the termination of the Consent Decree would result in class members losing eyeglasses, medical and dental exams or respite care. Moreover, there is no evidence suggesting that any class member has lost these services.

Plaintiff

CONSUMER ADVISORY BOARD

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**
STOCKING & CROTTEAU, LLC
46 BERRY COVE RD
LAMOINE, ME 04605
207/667-8294
Email: jcrotteau@adelphia.net
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
PINE TREE LEGAL ASSISTANCE,
INC.
61 MAIN ST.
ROOM 41
BANGOR, ME 04401
207-942-8241
Email: jesty-kendall@ptla.org
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
WOODRUFF AND MATHIS
218 COURT STREET
AUBURN, ME 04210
207-777-5136
TERMINATED: 07/09/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
PINE TREE LEGAL ASSISTANCE,
INC.
P.O. BOX 547
88 FEDERAL STREET
PORTLAND, ME 04112
(207) 774-8211, ext. 205
Fax: 207-828-2300
Email: tkelley@ptla.org
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

BRUCE A. MCGLAUF LIN
PETRUCCELLI, MARTIN &

HADDOW
50 MONUMENT SQUARE
PORTLAND, ME 04112
207-775-0200
Email: bmcglaulin@pmhlegal.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

GERALD F. PETRUCCELLI
PETRUCCELLI, MARTIN &
HADDOW
50 MONUMENT SQUARE
PORTLAND, ME 04112
775-0200
Email: gpetruccelli@pmhlegal.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

AMELIA DOE

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

MARY B DOE

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

FAYE DOE

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

JOHN DOE

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 07/09/1996

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 07/09/1993

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 07/09/1996

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

CAROL WYMAN

as guardian of APRIL WYMAN

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 07/09/1996

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 07/09/1993

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 07/09/1996

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

ROBERTA GOSSNER

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**

as guardian of PAMELA PERRO

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

JOHN PERRO
as guardian of PAMELA PERRO

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

ROBERT CLAVETTE

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

BONNIE HANSON

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

MARION TOOTHAKER
as guardian of WILLIAM
TOOTHAKER

represented by **JAMES R. CROTTEAU**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

ALL PLAINTIFFS

represented by **GERALD F. PETRUCCELLI**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JAMES R. CROTTEAU
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

BRUCE A. MCGLAUFLIN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JUDSON ESTY-KENDALL
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

NEVILLE WOODRUFF
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/23/1998
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS C. BRADLEY
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY
GENERAL
STATE HOUSE STATION 6
AUGUSTA, ME 04333-0006
207-626-8813
Fax: 207-626-8828
Email: thomas.bradley@maine.gov
TERMINATED: 04/20/2004
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

THOMAS H. KELLEY
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/09/1996
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

GLOVER, ROBERT W.
*In his capacity as Commissioner of
the Maine Department of Mental
Health and Mental Retardation*
TERMINATED: 03/02/1994

represented by **CHRISTOPHER LEIGHTON**
MAINE DEPARTMENT OF
HUMAN SERVICES
STATE HOUSE STATION 6
AUGUSTA, ME 04333
626-8540
Email: chris.leighton@maine.gov
TERMINATED: 03/02/1994
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

RICHARD G. BERGERON
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY
GENERAL
STATE HOUSE STATION 6
AUGUSTA, ME 04333-0006
626-8800
TERMINATED: 10/14/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

DESHAIES, ROGER
*In his capacity as Director of the
Bureau of Mental Retardation, Maine
Department of Mental Health &
Mental Retardation*

represented by **CHRISTOPHER LEIGHTON**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

RICHARD G. BERGERON
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 10/14/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Defendant

HARTLEY, DONALD
*In his capacity as Superintendent of
the Pineland Center*

represented by **CHRISTOPHER LEIGHTON**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

RICHARD G. BERGERON
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 10/14/1993
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Defendant

**MAINE DEPARTMENT OF
HEALTH AND HUMAN
SERVICES COMMISSIONER**

represented by **CHRISTOPHER LEIGHTON**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

JANET T. MILLS
MAINE ATTORNEY GENERAL'S
OFFICE
SIX STATE HOUSE STATION
AUGUSTA, ME 04333-0006
207-626-8599
Email: janet.t.mills@maine.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Notice Only Party

CLARENCE J SUNDRAM
AUDITOR

represented by **CLARENCE J SUNDRAM**
28 TIERNEY DRIVE
DELMAR, NY 12054
518-527-1918

Fax: 518-439-9740

Email:

cjsundram@alumni.ksg.harvard.edu

PRO SE