

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF MAINE**

**FRONTIER COMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION,**

Plaintiff

v.

**BARRETT PAVING MATERIALS,
INC., et al,**

Defendants

Civil No. 07-113-B-S

**ORDER AFFIRMING THE
RECOMMENDED DECISION OF THE MAGISTRATE JUDGE**

No objections having been filed to the Magistrate Judge's Recommended Decision (Docket No. 165) filed September 23, 2009, the Recommended Decision is **AFFIRMED.**

Accordingly, it is **ORDERED** that Plaintiff's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment (Docket No. 110) is **DENIED** without prejudice to its right to renew the motion following the close of discovery. It is also **ORDERED** that the Motion for Discovery (Docket No. 139) filed by the Railroad Defendants is **MOOTED.**

/s/ George Z. Singal
United States District Judge

Dated this 15th day of October, 2009.

Plaintiff

**FRONTIER
COMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION**
formerly known as
**CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS
COMPANY**

represented by **JOHN S. HAHN**
MAYER, BROWN LLP
1909 K STREET, N.W.
WASHINGTON , DC 20006-1101
(202) 263-3000
Email: jhahn@mayerbrown.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARTHA C. GAYTHWAITE
FRIEDMAN, GAYTHWAITE,
WOLF & LEAVITT
SIX CITY CENTER
PO BOX 4726
PORTLAND , ME 04112-4726
761-0900
Email: mgaythwaite@fgwl-
law.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

BRETT R. LELAND , ESQ.
FRIEDMAN, GAYTHWAITE,
WOLF & LEAVITT
SIX CITY CENTER
PO BOX 4726
PORTLAND , ME 04112-4726
207-761-0900
Email: bleland@fgwl-law.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JEFFREY A. MEYERS
NELSON, KINDER, MOSSEAU
& SATURLEY, P.C.
99 MIDDLE STREET
MANCHESTER , NH 03101
603-647-1800
Email: jmeyers@nkms.com
TERMINATED: 08/28/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**BARRETT PAVING
MATERIALS INC**
TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

represented by **DAVID B. VAN SLYKE**
PRETI, FLAHERTY,
BELIVEAU, PACHIOS &
HALEY, LLP
PO BOX 9546
PORTLAND , ME 04112-9546
791-3000
Email: dvalslyke@preti.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN P. MCVEIGH
PRETI, FLAHERTY,
BELIVEAU, PACHIOS &
HALEY, LLP
PO BOX 9546
PORTLAND , ME 04112-9546
791-3000
Fax: 791-3111
Email: jmcveigh@preti.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHAEL KAPLAN
PRETI, FLAHERTY,
BELIVEAU, PACHIOS &
HALEY, LLP
PO BOX 9546
PORTLAND , ME 04112-9546
791-3000
Email: mkaplan@preti.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

BEAZER EAST INC
TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

represented by **JEFFREY A. THALER**
BERNSTEIN, SHUR
100 MIDDLE STREET
P.O. BOX 9729
PORTLAND , ME 04104-5029
207-774-1200
Email: jthaler@bernsteinshur.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHAEL KAPLAN
(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**CENTERPOINT ENERGY
RESOURCES CORP**

TERMINATED: 09/22/2009

represented by **CHARLES T. WEHLAND**
JONES, DAY
77 WEST WACKER DRIVE
SUITE 3500
CHICAGO , IL 60601-1692
312-782-3939
Email: ctwehland@jonesday.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN H. GRADY
JONES DAY
1420 PEACHTREE ST, N.E.
ATLANTA , GA 30309
404-521-3939
Email: jhgrady@jonesday.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

LAURA M. EARL
JONES, DAY
77 WEST WACKER DRIVE
SUITE 3500
CHICAGO , IL 60601-1692
312-782-3939
Email: learl@jonesday.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

DAVID S. SHERMAN , JR
DRUMMOND WOODSUM &
MACMAHON
84 MARGINAL WAY
SUITE 600
PORTLAND , ME 04101-2480
207-772-1941
Fax: 207-772-3627
Email:
dshermanecf@dwmlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

DEAD RIVER COMPANY

represented by **LESLIE LYON ANDERSON**

TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

DEAD RIVER COMPANY
TWO MONUMENT SQUARE
#900
PORTLAND , ME 04112-8577
207-773-5841
Email:
leslie.anderson@deadriver.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ROBERT S. FRANK
MAINE HEALTH
465 CONGRESS STREET
SUITE 600
PORTLAND , ME 04101-3537
207-775-7001
Email: Frankr1@mainehealth.org
TERMINATED: 07/02/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

PAN AM RAILWAYS INC

represented by **ERIC L. HIRSCHHORN**
WINSTON & STRAWN, LLP
1700 K STREET, N.W.
WASHINGTON , DC 20006-3817
(202) 282-5706
Email: ehirschhorn@winston.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN FEHRENBACH
WINSTON & STRAWN, LLP
1700 K STREET, N.W.
WASHINGTON , DC 20006-3817
(202) 282-5925
Email: jfehrenbach@winston.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

FREDERICK F. COSTLOW
RICHARDSON, WHITMAN,
LARGE & BADGER
P.O. BOX 2429
ONE MERCHANTS PLAZA,
SUITE 603

BANGOR , ME 04402-2429
(207) 945-5900
Email: fcostlow@rwlb.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**HONEYWELL
INTERNATIONAL INC**
TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

represented by **GREGORY A. BIBLER**
GOODWIN PROCTOR LLP
EXCHANGE PLACE
53 STATE STREET
BOSTON , MA 02109
(617) 570-1000
Email:
gbibler@goodwinprocter.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

PAUL E. NEMSER
GOODWIN PROCTOR LLP
EXCHANGE PLACE
53 STATE STREET
BOSTON , MA 02109
(617)570-1000
Email:
pnemser@goodwinprocter.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ROBERT H. FITZGERALD
GOODWIN PROCTOR LLP
EXCHANGE PLACE
53 STATE STREET
BOSTON , MA 02109
(617)570-1000
Email:
rfitzgerald@goodwinprocter.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

FRANCIS G. KELLEHER
GOODWIN PROCTOR
EXCHANGE PLACE
53 STATE STREET
BOSTON , MA 2109-2881
617-570-1000
Email:

fkelleher@goodwinprocter.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHAEL KAPLAN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**MAINE CENTRAL
RAILROAD COMPANY**

represented by **ERIC L. HIRSCHHORN**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN FEHRENBACH
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CAROL I. EISENBERG
RICHARDSON, WHITMAN,
LARGE & BADGER
465 CONGRESS STREET
P.O. BOX 9545
PORTLAND , ME 04112-9545
(207) 774-7474
Email: ceisenberg@rwl.com
TERMINATED: 12/04/2008

FREDERICK F. COSTLOW
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**NORTH AMERICAN UTILITY
CONSTRUCTION COMPANY**
TERMINATED: 06/18/2009

Defendant

UGI UTILITIES INC

represented by **E. TUPPER KINDER**
NELSON, KINDER, MOSSEAU
& SATURLEY, P.C.
99 MIDDLE STREET
MANCHESTER , NH 03101
(603) 647-1800
Fax: 603-647-1900
Email: ekinder@nkms.com

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

JAY VARON
FOLEY & LARDNER
3000 K STREET NORTHWEST
WASHINGTON , DC 20007
(202) 672-5300
Email: jvaron@foleylaw.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

CHRISTOPHER D. HAWKINS
NELSON, KINDER, MOSSEAU
& SATURLEY, P.C.
99 MIDDLE STREET
MANCHESTER , NH 03101
(603)647-1800
Email: chawkins@nkms.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JEFFREY A. MEYERS
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 08/28/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Defendant

**US ARMY CORPS OF
ENGINEERS**
TERMINATED: 04/20/2009

represented by **MICHELLE T. DELEMARRE**
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF
JUSTICE
ADMIRALTY TRIAL DIVISION
P.O. BOX 14271
WASHINGTON , DC 20044-4271
(202) 616-4037
Email:
michelle.delemarre@usdoj.gov
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

PERRY M. ROSEN
US DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE
SECTION
PO BOX 23986
WASHINGTON , DC 20026-3986

202-353-7792
Email: perry.rosen@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

STEPHEN E. CROWLEY
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF
JUSTICE
ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE
SECTION
P.O. BOX 23986
WASHINGTON , DC 20026-3986
202-514-0165
Email:
stephen.crowley@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 09/22/2008
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor

STATE OF MAINE
TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

represented by **MARY M. SAUER**
MAINE ATTORNEY
GENERAL'S OFFICE
SIX STATE HOUSE STATION
AUGUSTA , ME 04333-0006
(207)626-8579
Email: mary.sauer@maine.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor

**MAINE DEPARTMENT OF
ENVIROMENTAL
PROTECTION**
TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

represented by **MARY M. SAUER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor

STATE OF MAINE
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

represented by **MARY M. SAUER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor

**MAINE DEPARTMENT OF
ENVIROMENTAL
PROTECTION**

represented by **MARY M. SAUER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

**BARRETT PAVING
MATERIALS INC**

TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

represented by **DAVID B. VAN SLYKE**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN P. MCVEIGH
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MICHAEL KAPLAN
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Counter Defendant

**FRONTIER
COMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION**

TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

formerly known as

**CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS
COMPANY**

represented by **BRETT R. LELAND , ESQ.**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN S. HAHN
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARTHA C. GAYTHWAITE
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

**HONEYWELL
INTERNATIONAL INC**

TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

represented by **GREGORY A. BIBLER**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

PAUL E. NEMSER
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ROBERT H. FITZGERALD

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

FRANCIS G. KELLEHER

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Counter Defendant

**FRONTIER
COMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION**

TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

formerly known as

**CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION**

formerly known as

**CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS
COMPANY**

represented by **BRETT R. LELAND , ESQ.**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN S. HAHN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARTHA C. GAYTHWAITE

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

BEAZER EAST INC

TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

represented by **JEFFREY A. THALER**

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Counter Defendant

**FRONTIER
COMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION**

TERMINATED: 02/05/2009

formerly known as

**CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS
COMPANY**

represented by **BRETT R. LELAND , ESQ.**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN S. HAHN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARTHA C. GAYTHWAITE

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

UGI UTILITIES INC

represented by **E. TUPPER KINDER**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JAY VARON

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CHRISTOPHER D. HAWKINS

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JEFFREY A. MEYERS

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 08/28/2009

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Counter Defendant

**FRONTIER
COMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION**

formerly known as

**CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS
COMPANY**

represented by **BRETT R. LELAND , ESQ.**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN S. HAHN

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARTHA C. GAYTHWAITE

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

DEAD RIVER COMPANY
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

represented by **LESLIE LYON ANDERSON**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ROBERT S. FRANK
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/02/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Counter Defendant

**FRONTIER
COMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION**
formerly known as
**CITIZENS COMMUNICATIONS
COMPANY**

represented by **BRETT R. LELAND , ESQ.**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN S. HAHN
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARTHA C. GAYTHWAITE
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ThirdParty Plaintiff

DEAD RIVER COMPANY
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

represented by **LESLIE LYON ANDERSON**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ROBERT S. FRANK
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/02/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

ThirdParty Defendant

ROBINSON SPEIRS
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

represented by **SAMUEL W. LANHAM , JR.**
LANHAM BLACKWELL, P.A.
470 EVERGREEN WOODS
BANGOR , ME 04401
(207) 942-2898
Email:
slanham@lanhamblackwell.com
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ThirdParty Defendant

ELIZABETH H SPEIRS
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

represented by **SAMUEL W. LANHAM , JR.**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ThirdParty Defendant

ROBINSON SPEIRS, JR
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

represented by **SAMUEL W. LANHAM , JR.**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ThirdParty Defendant

MARY S PRICE
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

represented by **SAMUEL W. LANHAM , JR.**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ThirdParty Defendant

NANCY S DAWSON
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

represented by **SAMUEL W. LANHAM , JR.**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ThirdParty Defendant

JULIE ANN MACMANNIS
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009

represented by **SAMUEL W. LANHAM , JR.**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/22/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

PAN AM RAILWAYS INC

represented by **ERIC L. HIRSCHHORN**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN FEHRENBACH
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

FREDERICK F. COSTLOW
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

**MAINE CENTRAL
RAILROAD COMPANY**

represented by **ERIC L. HIRSCHHORN**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN FEHRENBACH
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CAROL I. EISENBERG
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 12/04/2008

FREDERICK F. COSTLOW
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Counter Defendant

**FRONTIER
COMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION**

represented by **JOHN S. HAHN**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARTHA C. GAYTHWAITE
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

BRETT R. LELAND , ESQ.
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JEFFREY A. MEYERS
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/28/2009
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ThirdParty Plaintiff

PAN AM RAILWAYS INC

represented by **ERIC L. HIRSCHHORN**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN FEHRENBACH
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

FREDERICK F. COSTLOW
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

ThirdParty Plaintiff

**MAINE CENTRAL
RAILROAD COMPANY**

represented by **ERIC L. HIRSCHHORN**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOHN FEHRENBACH
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CAROL I. EISENBERG
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 12/04/2008

FREDERICK F. COSTLOW
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

ThirdParty Defendant

CITY OF BANGOR

ThirdParty Defendant

NORMAN HEITMANN

ThirdParty Defendant

EDWARD BARRETT