

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF MAINE**

**ONE AND KEN VALLEY HOUSING )  
GROUP, ET AL., )**

**PLAINTIFFS )**

**v. )**

**CIVIL No. 1:09-cv-642-DBH**

**MAINE STATE HOUSING )  
AUTHORITY, )**

**DEFENDANT AND )  
THIRD-PARTY PLAINTIFF )**

**v. )**

**SHAUN DONOVAN, *Secretary,* )  
*United States Department of* )  
*Housing & Urban Development,* )**

**THIRD-PARTY DEFENDANT )**

**ORDER AFFIRMING RECOMMENDED DECISION  
OF THE MAGISTRATE JUDGE**

On April 17, 2012, the United States Magistrate Judge filed with the court, with copies to counsel, her Recommended Decision on the parties' motions for summary judgment. The plaintiffs filed their objection to the Recommended Decision on May 4, 2012, and the defendant Maine State Housing Authority filed its objection on the same date. Oral argument was held on July 16, 2012.

I have reviewed and considered the Recommended Decision, together with the entire record; I have made a *de novo* determination of all matters

adjudicated by the Recommended Decision; and I concur with the recommendation of the United States Magistrate Judge for the reasons set forth in the Recommended Decision, and determine that no further proceeding is necessary.

It is therefore **ORDERED** that the Recommended Decision of the Magistrate Judge is hereby **ADOPTED**. Summary judgment is **GRANTED** to the defendants Maine State Housing Authority and the United States Department for Housing and Urban Development. The plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment is **DENIED**.

**SO ORDERED.**

**DATED THIS 20<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF JULY, 2012**

/s/D. Brock Hornby  
**D. BROCK HORNBY**  
**UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE**

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF MAINE (BANGOR)  
CIVIL DOCKET NO. 1:09CV642-DBH

**One and Ken Valley Housing  
Group,**

**Two and Ken Valley Housing  
Group,**

**Three and Ken Valley Housing  
Group,**

**Five and Ken Valley Housing  
Group,**

**Six and Ken Valley Housing  
Group,**

**Plaintiffs**

**v.**

**Maine State Housing Authority,**

**Defendant and  
Third-Party Plaintiff**

**v.**

**Shaun Donovan, Secretary, United  
States Department of Housing  
and Urban Development,**

**Third-Party Defendant**

Represented By **Harry J. Kelly, III**  
Nixon Peabody LLP  
401 Ninth Street, NW, Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20004  
(202) 585-8712  
email: [hkelly@nixonpeabody.com](mailto:hkelly@nixonpeabody.com)

**Holly J. Kilibarda**  
**W. Scott O'Connell**  
Nixon Peabody, LLP  
900 Elm Street, 14th Floor  
Manchester, NH 03101-2031  
(603) 628-4000  
email: [hkilibarda@nixonpeabody.com](mailto:hkilibarda@nixonpeabody.com)  
[soconnell@nixonpeabody.com](mailto:soconnell@nixonpeabody.com)

Represented By **Barry Paul Steinberg**  
**Robert A. Jaffe**  
Law Office of Barry Paul Steinberg  
1101 Connecticut Avenue NW  
Suite 1000  
Washington, DC 20036  
(202) 828-2400  
email:  
[barry.steinberg@kutakrock.com](mailto:barry.steinberg@kutakrock.com)  
[robert.jaffe@kutarock.com](mailto:robert.jaffe@kutarock.com)

**John Bobrowiecki**  
Maine State Housing Authority  
353 Water Street  
Augusta, ME 04330-4633  
(207) 626-4600  
email:  
[jbobrowiecki@mainehousing.org](mailto:jbobrowiecki@mainehousing.org)

Represented By **Kyle A. Forsyth**  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P. O. Box 875  
Ben Franklin Station  
Washington, DC 20044  
(202) 307-0452  
email: [kyle.forsyth@usdoj.gov](mailto:kyle.forsyth@usdoj.gov)